



PAZARLAMA ETİĞİNDE GÜNCEL SORUNLAR VE UYGULAMALAR

CURRENT PROBLEMS AND APPLICATIONS IN MARKETING ETHICS

Öğr. Gör. Ayşegül NALBANTOĞLU

İzmir Katip Çelebi Üniversitesi, Teknoloji Transfer Ofisi / TÜRKİYE, ORCID: 0000-0001-9578-1767

ÖZET

Etik, yeni bir kavram olmamakla birlikte, işletmelerde etiğe verilen önem gittikçe daha da artmaktadır. Özellikle son yıllarda işletmelerde etik çöküşlerin gündeme gelmesiyle, tüketicilerin işletmelere ve işletme yöneticilerine olan güvenleri sarsılmıştır. Dolayısıyla bu durum, en başta iş etiği konusu olmak üzere kurumsal yönetim ve kurumsal sosyal sorumluluk gibi konulara olan ilginin artmasına neden olmuştur. İşletme etiği söz konusu olduğunda etik ile ilgili ortaya çıkan sorunların ve yanlış uygulamaların çoğu pazarlama kavramı ile doğrudan ilişkilidir. Önceki yıllarda pazarlama etiği konusu yazında iş etiği başlığı altında incelenmiştir ve pazarlama etiğinin işletmelerde uygulanmasıyla ilgili sorunlar ve eleştiriler gündeme gelmiştir. Bu çalışma ile hedeflenen; etik kavramının tartışılıp, sorgulanması ve pazarlama uygulamalarında karşılaşılan etik sorunlar ile bu uygulamalara getirilen ve literatürde yer alan toplumsal eleştirilerin genel hatlarının çizilmesidir.

Anahtar Kelimeler: etik, pazarlama, işletme etiği, pazarlama etiği, iş etiği

ABSTRACT

Although ethics is not a new concept, the importance given to ethics in enterprises is increasing everyday. Especially in recent years, ethical collapse of enterprises has shaken the trust of consumers in enterprises and business managers. Therefore, this has led to an increasing interest in issues such as corporate governance, corporate social responsibility, and primarily business ethics. When it comes to business ethics, most of the ethical issues and misapplications are directly related to the marketing concept. In the previous years, there has been ethical problems related to the application of the concept of marketing ethics, which is examined under the title of business ethics in the literature. This study aims to discuss and question the concept of ethics and ethical problems encountered in the marketing practices and give general information about the critics on this issue within the literature.

Keywords: ethics, marketing, business ethics, marketing ethics, work ethics

1. INTRODUCTION

The term ethics is derived from the greek word “ethos” which means habit and tradition. The word “moral”, which means “ahlaki” in Turkish, also comes from the Latin word “mores” (Pojman, 2001: 2). Ethics can be expressed as the research on the structure and foundations of morality which expresses moral judgments, standards and behavior patterns (Hunt and Vitell, 1986: 759). In other words, ethics is moral philosophy. Moral philosophy; makes philosophical research about ideas, rules and values about right and wrong, good and bad, how to behave and how not to behave (Raphael, 1994: 8).

Singer, while emphasizing misunderstandings about what ethics is, pointed out the basic points about what ethics is not. According to Singer (1993a: 2);

- It is not a system which is successful in theory and not practical in practice. An ethical judgement that is not good in practice will be theoretically wrong. Because the main purpose of ethical judgments is to guide the practice.
- It is not just a concept that has meaning in the religious framework. There is no requirement to believe in any religion to conduct ethical conduct. Immanuel Kant, a well-known philosopher

known for his commitment to Christianity, insulted those who put forward God's rewards and punishments to abide by moral rules.

- It is not relative or subjective. If the relativity approach is accepted, it argues that ethical rules are meaningful in the society in which they are accepted and another society cannot discuss the truth or wrongness of these moral rules, the main purpose of ethics will be eliminated. If torture of animals in a society is considered wrong, and in another it is considered correct, according to the relativity approach, both behaviors will be considered right because they have meaning in their own communities. In this case, any discussion of whether the behavior is correct or not will not be meaningful. However, as we have already mentioned, ethics tries to reach the correct and inaccuracies with general validity.
- It is not a group of prohibitions on sexuality. Decisions about sexuality, honesty, thinking of others, common sense etc. and the subject of ethics is not the sexuality itself, but the issues mentioned above (Kesim, 2004: 6).

Ethical principles emerge as a result of years of development and all individuals are responsible for reviewing the ethical values and behaviors in the workplace, in society and in the decision-making process. An important part of the social life in question is undoubtedly the business life. The concept that we face for this important element is business ethics. Business ethics is an attempt to describe right and wrong behavior in all areas of economic life and to reach general moral rules (Senturk, 2008: 83).

When the work ethic is mentioned in the literature, work ethic and professional ethics are the concepts that come to mind. In general, business ethics refers to an area that encompasses work ethics and professional ethics. Business ethics is an attempt to describe right and wrong behavior in all areas of economic life and to reach general moral rules. Professional ethics relates to the definition of the principles and rules within a profession. Work ethics also examines the values of the employees' working life and its development from the history to the present.

Ethics is mostly related to morally correct - wrong or good - bad. Ethical principles and rules make common life possible as the unifying of society, and ensure the social order. Business ethics, as a subset of ethics, examines ethical issues in the business world and aims to develop rules to guide behavior.

The concept of business ethics includes work ethics and professional ethics. Work ethics are values and attitudes towards the work in a society. Professional ethics is also related to business ethics and work ethics and overlaps to some extent. However, the principles of professional ethics are generally independent of social culture and values and are universal.

The continuity of their activities and lives is the main purpose of the enterprises. In today's business world, the way to achieve this is not only to make profit, but to fulfill the social responsibilities of enterprises. In the 80s, the Watergate scandal and then the written and visual media criticized the public and private enterprises very heavily due to various unethical behaviors. For this reason, it has been observed that the development of the institutions and organizations conscious in this field in the 1980s and 90s is supported by the society, the determination of the rules of business ethics and the supervision of its implementation have gained importance. In addition, it is seen that the limitations of the enterprises on certain issues are more beneficial than the limitations of the laws and governments (Senturk, 2007).

The fact that enterprises take more social responsibility is a radical change in social priorities. On the other hand, the fact that business managers see social responsibility function as an activity to be applied only when it is inevitable and when their business is directly threatened will cause a great harm to their businesses especially in the long term. Business ethics should be a matter of concern for all businesses. Socially responsible behavior inevitably raises the economic costs of the enterprise. In the long term, significant benefits exist for both business and society.

The idea that ethics cannot be associated with business is still very common. It is common to think that ethical principles should be abandoned in order to achieve economic objectives of enterprises. Since the business creates an indefinite social life where ethical principles can be applied, encouraged, and altered, an ethical climate should be established to support the ethical underpinnings of social responsibility. At the same time, it is necessary to establish an organizational culture that prioritizes ethical values. In a competitive global economic order, the belief that businesses are able to survive, to reexamine their

current position and where they are heading, is an opportunity to rethink the rules of human values and business life (Bayram, 2005: 2).

In today's working life, organizations are making important arrangements in terms of ethical decision making such as ethical behavior development, building an ethical corporate culture and solving the problems they face on the basis of ethical theories. In particular, it is desirable for organizations to develop a working culture in which employees depend on ethical principles and values in decision-making processes. The fundamental step to be made by organizations that produce goods and services is to work effectively and efficiently in order to institutionalize the process of standard ethical decision-making and the implementation of this decision. Although legal regulations are used to overcome ethical dilemmas, it is indispensable for the ethical decision-making process and social benefit. In addition to these, we can state that the most important problematic of an organization in terms of business ethics is insecurity. When insecurity is evaluated in an ethical context, we can observe an established quality consciousness, ethical decision making process, the existence of competent personnel with problem solving skills, and the participation in the solution of the problems and development processes (Seker, 2013: 69-70).

The Corporate Social Responsibility (CSR) issue associated with ethics, which is also related to Bowen's book (*Social Responsibilities of the Businessman*, 1953) attracted considerable attention between the late 1960s and early 1980s (Bannerjee, 2007). Rogene Buchholz summarizes the basic ideas that give rise to the corporate social responsibility (CSR) concept (Gummesson, 2000):

1. Organizations have responsibilities beyond product and profit generation.
2. These responsibilities are particularly related to the elimination of the social problems that they assist in their emergence.
3. Institutions have more responsibility than each stakeholder has on their own.
4. The impacts of institutions are beyond the market they are in.
5. CSR represents a wider range of human values than economic values.

Today, there are different pressure groups that will lead businesses to be more sensitive about accepting ethical principles and responsibilities. These include consumer unions, various non-governmental organizations to protect the interests of consumers, trade unions that protect the rights of employees and the enterprises that employ child labor, and international labor organizations, media organizations, and the society as a whole. It should be noted that enterprises must have the necessary social responsibility and the state should be encouraging in the implementation of ethical business processes. It is the responsibility of the state to monitor and punish firms that are particularly involved in corruption and non-market behavior (Aras, 2004: 100).

From the 1990s onwards, the sensitivity issue has included the "production process" as much as the quality of the goods or services consumed. In the event that some non-ethical elements are involved in the production process, it is seen that non-governmental organizations that are sensitive to this issue are trying to influence the customers in order not to buy goods or services. The most concrete example of this is that Nike, a manufacturer of sports equipment, was boycotted for its products in North America and Europe because it employed child workers in the Far Eastern production workshops. Subsequently, the fraudulent financial reporting scandals in some of the major companies have raised the insecurity in company management. In this context, besides corporate ethics, the issue of corporate governance has also come to the fore (TUSIAD report, 2009: 27).

2. MARKETING ETHICS

Marketing is known as a human activity directed at satisfying needs and wants through exchange processes (Kotler and Turner, 1981: 82). Marketing ethics is the application of ethical evaluations to marketing strategies and tactics. It is believed that the ethical approach can be beneficial and useful because of the satisfaction of the consumer needs in this process of change (Fritsche and Becker, 1983: 291). In this framework, business or marketing ethics can be defined as the behaviors of producers, intermediaries and end buyers in accordance with each other's rights and freedoms. It is possible to see the theoretical and practical studies in this literature (Kurtuldu, 2009: 84).

The pressure between ethics and the difficulties of economic life in today's competitive markets is one of the inevitable facts for many managers and enterprises (Camenisch, 1991: 245). For this reason, it would be easier for the managers to make an ethical decision that the perspectives of the events should be in the form of targeting reasonable profitability rather than maximizing their profits (Chonko, 1995: 10).

The actions of the enterprises to maximize their profits, regardless of their costs to the environment, society or consumers, are unethical actions (Ergeneli, 1996: 103). The second issue is the short-term thinking of managers rather than long-term considerations (Chonko, 1995: 10). In order to overcome these difficulties, promoting ethical behaviors and developing a business culture for the prevention of unethical behaviors is an important task of marketing management (Hunt / Vasquez-Parraga, 1993: 78). When marketing ethics is mentioned, two definitions are encountered, one is ethic and the other is moral (Gummesson, 2000):

1. A systematic work discipline for marketing decisions, practices and moral evaluation of institutions.
2. A set of standards and norms required to describe marketing activities as morally wrong or accurate.

As a factor in gaining the importance of marketing ethics, the impact of the works that have been intensified in the last two decades on business ethics cannot be denied. As a continuation of the increasing interest in business ethics, research on marketing ethics has also started. Examining the subject of marketing ethics, whether or not marketing practices are ethical; in other words, these practices are evaluated as true or wrong (Dibb et al., 2001: 757). In Smith's terms (1996: 10), marketing ethics encompasses an application of ethical thinking on marketing decision-making. In other words, marketing ethics, guides the marketing managers in the enterprises to adopt the right behaviors.; through the application of ethical theories to marketing decisions. For this reason the enterprises, should be focusing on the solution of ethical issues to arise and develop mechanisms for the prevention of the unethical applications beforehand.

Enterprises face ethical dilemmas in many decisions related to product, price, distribution and promotion such as playing trade secrets, violation of customer rights, discrimination, bribery, misuse of monopoly power, product quality and safety, misleading advertisements, polluting the environment, not giving the rights of the distribution channel members, misleading pricing etc. (Kotler, 1994: 764). Ethical companies are developing marketing policies and guidelines covering distributor relations, advertising standards, customer services, pricing, product development and general ethical standards. However, it is seen that even the best guide of compelling ethical situations may not be solved sufficiently (Tek and Ozgul, 2007: 912). For example, it is not always easy to determine the limit of the behaviors of the salesperson to persuade the customer to buy (Guler, 2014: 65-75).

The leading reasons for the increasing importance of marketing ethics are globalization and the ruthless competitive environment. Whysall, (2000: 178) states that the first of the two most important factors causing the globalization of industry is the need to obtain shares in domestic and foreign markets and the other factor is the search for cheap product sources in international area to gain competitive advantage in the domestic market. The increasingly competitive marketing environment provides opportunities for non-ethical marketing behavior. However, thanks to the developments in communication technology, it has become easier to reach the information about the companies evaluating these opportunities and the applications of the enterprises have become more visible. Marketing ethics is an important topic of discussion today, the role of non-ethical marketing applications that trigger each other in the globalized world and their results' reaching a large number of people quickly through mass media play an important role in this (Torlak, 2001: 142).

The availability of information brought about the public reaction. Today, the consumer movement and the environmentalist lobby became a strong force waiting to be alert to the actions that might harm the society (Brennan, 1991: 8). Consumers increasingly state that ethical evaluations play an important role in their purchasing behavior (Crane, 2001: 361; Schelegelmich, 1998: 3). Trevino and Nelson (1995: 25); considering that the media focuses on the issues that the public attaches importance to, the media reported that the density of news on this issue proves the importance given to the marketing ethics of the society.

Nowadays, marketing ethics research centers are established and, marketing ethics courses are included in the courses of business departments in many universities, seminars and conferences are organized in an increasing manner on the subject, books and articles are published and many enterprises constitute the codes of ethics related to their marketing activities. It is observed that the managers who take the importance of public opinion on ethical reputation started to use marketing ethics as a competitive tool (Kesim, 2004: 46-47).

It is not enough to consider ethics only in terms of business and marketing. Each manager should place the ethical values in the focus of his / her business and private life and set an example for the employees in this matter. In societal terms, it can be said that in societies where individuals with ethical values exist, people can establish positive and balanced relations and this situation positively affects the productivity and welfare of society. This situation reveals that the ethical issue starts with the moral education, which is rooted in the family, continues at school and modeled by observing the behaviors of individuals in the society. Therefore, the basis of ethics is a phenomenon that develops through the experiences and observations extending to childhood and shaping the behaviors of individuals.

3. SOCIAL CRITICISM IN MARKETING

3.1. The Effect Of Marketing On Consumers

3.1.1. High Prices

It is one of the issues criticized by the society that intermediaries increase their prices more than the offered services deserve. Similar criticism include these points at the same time (Kotler vd., 2004);

- There are too many intermediaries,
- Some of them are inefficient and weak,
- As a result, distribution is very costly and this leads to high product prices.

Companies respond to this as follows;

- If the intermediaries do not do this, the producers will do,
- The price increase triggers the creation of services that consumers desire (big stores and classification, longer working hours),
- Continuous increase in storage costs affect prices,
- In fact, tool competition is so intense that profit margins are really low,
- The competition between chain stores causes them to work effectively and keep prices low.

According to a research, the majority of the companies (61.6 per cent or 109 in total) stated that pricing decisions involve ethical considerations, suggesting the importance of an ethical behavior when levying prices. According to data from 177 industrial service companies operating in the transportation and information technology sectors, the study concludes that the majority of the companies think that pricing should take ethical considerations into account. Especially, the pricing practices that were reported to lead to non-ethical behavior refer to the determination of prices that lead to excessive profits or take advantage of the customer's needs (Indounas, 2008:161-169)

3.1.2. High Advertisement And Promotion Costs

Critics say that intensive advertising and promotion have also raised product prices. For example, a dozen intensely promoted aspirin is one hundred times more expensive than a non-branded drug. Promotional and packaging costs of differentiated products such as cosmetics, detergents, toilet products constitute 40% or even more of the price offered by the manufacturer. Criticism states that promotion and packaging add only a psychological value to the product rather than a functional value.

Marketers respond to these criticisms by saying that consumers generally prefer to buy functional products at low prices. However, consumers are also willing to buy attractive, rich and special products. These types of products can be more expensive, but on the one hand, continuous quality is guaranteed.

- If consumers want to know what products are available in the market, they have to ask companies to advertise.

- Existing competitive environment may also drive companies into over-advertising. Avoiding competitive expenditures is not rational for companies.
- At the same time, firms are sensitive to cost and use their budget wisely.

According to research, within the marketing variables that affect the purchase decision when buying a food product, advertising takes place in the top five. An increase in sales will be achieved through efforts to improve the importance of the advertisement in the event that the enterprises are sufficiently grasped. In order to rank the types of advertising in terms of persistence, television advertisements are the first. Because the addition of movement to visuality will increase the permanence in mind (Cevik, 2011: 98).

Companies are making various efforts and implementing strategies by observing their rivals in order to realize the sale of a product or service in today's world of intensive competition. Although the companies plan and develop the products and services in accordance with the consumer demands and needs, efforts for pricing at affordable rates and with the appropriate distribution available to the consumer are not sufficient for the purchase of the product by the consumers in the market.

In addition, the company needs sales-enhancing efforts (Mucuk 2007). In order to meet this requirement, promotional activities are encountered. According to a definition, promotion is the communication activities carried out to convince others to accept ideas, concepts and things in marketing (Stanton, 1991, Etzel and Walker, 1991). As it is included in this definition, promotion is a communication activity and has a basic function such as persuasion.

The importance of advertising among marketing variables when selecting a food product was researched with the consumers participating in a survey. As a result, 32 of the 100 consumers surveyed considered the advertisement to be at the 5th degree. In addition, quality was at the 1st degree with the response of 83 consumers; brand was 2nd degree with the answer of 38 consumers; brand, again was at the 3rd degree with the response of 32 consumers; purchasing habits was in the 6th degree with the response of 32 consumers and packaging was considered in the 4th degree of importance by the response of 26 consumers (Cevik, 2011: 85).

3.1.3. Price Increases

Criticism reveals that the firms are putting their products on the market at a price much more than their cost. Marketers claim that most companies make a fair exchange with their customers (Kotler et al., 2004). Several complaining authorities are already available for those who behave unethically. Also, it is often stated that consumers do not understand the reason for the high price increases. For example, the price increases made by the pharmaceutical industry include sales and promotion as well as R & D costs.

On the other hand, based on a series of four test market experiments for three food products and one household cleaning product, Eskin and Baron (1977) conclude that increases in advertising expenditures increase sales and that such increases are greater under low price conditions than under high price conditions; thus, there appears to be a negative price- advertising interaction (Rao, 1984:52). A similar finding that advertising may serve to increase price sensitivity is reported by Wittink (1977). Farris and Al-bion (1980) review arguments on the question of how advertising affects prices and review empirical research. Consequently, effective advertising strategies should be implemented in order to increase sales and provide low price conditions with reasonable increases.

3.1.4. Deceptive Practises

Such applications can be examined under 3 headings: deceptive pricing, promotion, packaging (Kotler et al., 2004). Deceptive pricing is particularly evident in discourses such as factory sales prices or wholesale prices. Discounts for 12 months under the name of "all season long" and first "discounts", after then "increasements" can be added to this category.

As the example of deceptive promotions, exaggerating the characteristics and performance of the product and fraudulent bargaining by stating that the product is not in stock can be given.

As an example of deceptive packaging, packages are not filled up to the top of the product, and misleading marking and terms are used (Senturk, 2010). For example, in the ice cream industry, ice

cream is sold not as kilogram, but as liters and consumers always perceive liter as kilogram and buy the product.

Deceptive practices caused legal regulations. For example, an organization controlled the cosmetics industry and its products in the UK. If the company claims that the product will rejuvenate somebody as 20-year-olds before, it is required to prove this claim with the documents. In addition, the laws require that the animal experiments be supported with the statement that at what stages these experiments are conducted.

It is not always easy to define what is deceptive. Shell, for example, used Super Hell fuel in its advertisement to prove that the product provides more distance to travel than untreated fuels. However, other processed fuels provide the same benefits. Shell covered this fact. Discursively, there was no error in this advertisement, but the Federal Trade Commission did not think the same (Kotler et al., 2004).

As an example of the cases in Turkey, a customer attempts to buy a jacket with 70 % discount of the price tag as written on the shop window but he is informed that the price on the tag is the discounted price and the original price is more than this price. The customer demands any proof such as the invoice on the sale of the product from the claimed original price but he is not provided with any documents by the company. He buys the product and lodges a complaint against the company by the means of Arbitration Committee for Consumer Problems. According to Consumer Arbitration Law Number 6502, the discounted sale price of the goods or services and the original price should be shown on the labels. The proof that the goods or services subject to discounted sales are offered for sale at a price lower than the price before belongs to the seller or the provider. It was seen that the company which was complained did not give a defense against this. For this reason, it was decided that the paid price should be subjected to promised discount so the price gap should be compensated. According to the Consumer Law, it is the seller's burden to prove the original price before the discount. (Sozcu Newspaper, 2018).

3.1.5. High Pressure For Sales

Criticism states that sellers are manipulating the consumers to buy products where they do not require. Products such as cars, insurance, furniture, accessories are not bought and but sold. Sellers are also forced to sell these by their employers because high premiums are promised to those who achieve sales success (Kotler et al., 2004).

Financial Services Authority Inspections (Kotler et al., 2004):

- As a result of these inspections, the insurance company was sentenced to fines for preparing fraudulent policies between 1980-90.

- Personal persuasion efforts were used to sell unsuitable policies to customers.

- Early on the list of insurance companies, Abbey Life's penalty was 1.5 million euros. This company applied unethical sales to its customers.

- Lloyds TSB, the owner of this insurance company, paid 165 million pounds in compensation.

In 2003, 50,000 complaints were received on collective capital accumulation and fraudulent sales in this area cost the insurance industry \$ 14 billion. The organizations that aim to protect consumers and defending the rights of consumers have been achieving success in this regard.

- Sellers and companies applying unethical commercial applications are punished. However, it should not be ignored which of the sides is more powerful in these cases. This picture becomes clearer, especially when considering the low level of consciousness and education status of the less developed countries.

- A new question of debate in the UK is the raise on the sound of broadcasting technically during advertisement broadcasts. Advertisement Standards Authority is expected to make legal arrangements on this issue.

- Marketers who apply high sales pressure in most cases are of little benefit. Because this type of sales often leads to one-time shopping.

3.1.6. The Products Which Are Unreliable And Having Poor Quality

The first complaint from consumers about quality is that products or services are not manufactured or carried out effectively. The second complaint is that some products offer less than expected benefits. For example, some nutrients of healthy food products may be too low. The third point of complaint is that the products are not reliable. This problem arises for many reasons: the indifference of the producer, the technological complexity of the products, the less educated workforce and the poor quality control. For example, due to technical errors, automobile manufacturers have recalled many cars at different times. One of the highest numbers of recalling is Chrysler with 900,000 units and Volkswagen with 350,000 units.

A product-harm crisis occurs when products contain hazardous materials and it can cause serious injury or death if used improperly by violating safety standards (Pruitt and Peterson, 1986). The increasing complexity of products and markets (related, among the others, to the extension of production and distribution chains and to the growing use of outsourcing agreements with companies located in countries where product safety standards are less stringent), the activities of associations for consumer protection, the more stringent product safety legislation and the intervention of governmental associations have made product-harm crises recurring events (Dawar and Pillutla, 2000).

❖ The establishment of independent audit firms on product errors and quality problems led to a number of important evaluations such as mowing machines that could cause injuries and faulty car designs. This situation gives both consumers the chance to choose the right product and also encourages producers to remove their faulty products.

❖ Sometimes marketers may face dilemmas in establishing a balance between consumer needs and social responsibility. For example, it is not possible to guarantee the safety of the cars after the customer values the speed and power. Customers may demand an unprotected electric saw machine on the grounds that it is cheaper, but government and consumer organizations may see it as irresponsible and find it as unethical.

❖ Most responsible manufacturers want to produce quality products. Customer satisfaction will provide profitable customer relations. Failure to satisfy the customer will prevent repurchases and the customer will defame the product for others. Product liability and safety concerns are major issues that can lead manufacturers to bankruptcy.

A recall can represent a major crisis for a manufacturer and can seriously damage the brand integrity, the corporate reputation and profitability (Cheah et al., 2007). During a product crisis, consumers receive bad news about the company and its products so their attitude towards the company may deteriorate suddenly. Successful handling of the crisis is therefore essential (Magno, 2012:1310). Some authors (Jolly and Mowen, 1985; De Matos and Vargas Rossi, 2007) argue that a firm can mitigate the negative effects of a product-harm crisis by implementing a voluntary recall and being socially responsible and showing real concern for consumer health (Souiden and Pons, 2009).

3.1.7. Planned Obsolescence

- Salers are accused of deliberate obsolescence tactics to obtain more or earlier purchases. The most obvious example of this is to make outfits obsolete through new designs.
- A number of manufacturers are also accused of consciously keeping their newly developed designs and technologies behind.
- Consumers are also often upset by camera, watch, and mobile phone manufacturers because of very frequent model changes.
- Fast model replacement makes it difficult to find spare parts for old models.
- Planned obsolescence causes the price of previous models to drop rapidly.

Marketers respond to them as follows:

- Consumers love style changes. Consumers are starting to get bored of old models and are looking for a new fashion and design. No one is forced to get a new look, if few people were willing to do this, this model would have collapsed.
- As far as technological products are concerned, consumers are demanding the latest innovations, even if the old models still operate.
- At the same time, if they do not launch these new products, the rival brands will continue and grab their market share.
- Companies do not want to lose their customers so they do not design their products in a way that can deteriorate quickly. Instead, they want to ensure that customer satisfaction is provided by pursuing continuous improvement and prevent these kind of problems.
- What is called planned obsolescence is actually the most advanced products and services developed by technology and competition in a free society.

While innovation and technological progress are good (*ceteris paribus*), the gains from some new products may not always be worth the consumer or societal cost. To the extent consumers and society at large incur the economic and environmental costs associated with disposal of durable goods, the more frequent the replacement and the less recyclable the durable, the greater the problem (Guiltinan,2008:23).

The leading firms in developing eco-innovations are those that have fully integrated such tools into their new product development planning so that they think in a positive sustainability mode rather than a reactive mode of just eliminating environmentally problematic features (Pujari, 2006:76-85).

3.1.8. Poor Quality Service For Low Income Consumers

- Marketing is being accused of offering poor quality services to low-income consumers. Poor consumers in rural areas shop at small stores and pay high prices for low quality products.
- Only profit-targeted marketing does not see low-income consumers as a target market on their own. High-income consumers are the preferred market.

Clearly, better marketing systems should be developed for low-income consumers. Moreover, this section often requires consumer protection. Consumer protection associations should act on intermediaries who make deceptive advertisements, sell old products as new, and make a lot of pressure for payment-guaranteed sales. Unethical behaviours should be punished to pay compensation to consumers.

According to a study, if a consumer is not willing to pay for a specific quality, it can be due to many other reasons than the lack of interest in quality:

- the product does not, in the objective sense, have the specific quality the manufacturer claims,
- the consumer does not desire the specific quality (enough), i.e. the consumer does not consider the quality improvement to be worth the price difference,
- the consumer does not realize that the product actually has the specific quality (Horska and others, 2011: 499).

3.2. The Impact of Marketing On Society

3.2.1. Too Much Materialism

Especially after the 80's, wealth around the world has become a success criterion. Greed is good, great is beautiful and the idioms such as shopping until death appeared in this period, and people started to show much interest on having big homes, luxury cars and using the latest electronic equipment.

Although there has been reactions to richness, abundance and waste in the past ten years and the return to more fundamental values and social cohesion has started but the illusion of the materialism still remains seducing.

- Criticism evaluates the interest in material things as the false demands of marketing rather than seeing it as a feature of human nature.
- Companies pay a lot of money to advertising companies to attract consumers' interest to their products.
- People are working harder to buy the necessary things. The increasing demand increases the production of national capital, the increased production leads to more advertising and this leads to more demand. In other words, it is a spiral that cannot be solved.
- In this way, marketing makes the capital more satisfied than the consumers by bringing out the wrong desires.

In a study of consumer desire Belk, Ger, and Askegaard (2003) conclude that, "Consumer imaginations of and cravings for consumer goods not yet possessed can mesmerize and seem to promise magical meaning in life. Among the sorcerers helping to enchant these goods are advertisers, retailers, peddlers, and other merchants of mystique" (p. 327). Whether as mirrors or drivers of magical thinking, marketing and advertising have inexorably promoted an ideology of "the good life" as a material paradise (Belk and Pollay 1985). Marketing, it would seem, provides detailed instructions on how to live the good life (Scott and others, 2014:283).

Counter Arguments:

- Criticism exaggerates the power of firms in revealing needs.
- Marketers are more successful than introducing new needs when addressing current needs. The high rate of failure of new products indicates that firms cannot control demand.
- When we go deeper, we need to say that people's values are influenced not only by marketers, but also by family, friends, religion, race and education. (Are these groups also not affected by marketers?)
- If developed societies are very materialist, these values stem from the basic socialization processes that go deeper and deeper rather than trade and mass media.

Marketing systems are prime movers of both matter and meaning, shaping culture both material and immaterial. Most of the goods and services that people consume across the globe are produced and distributed by marketing institutions, and marketing is the same system that attaches much of the meaning to those goods and services. In many ways marketing at the macro level is the perfect institutionalization of the new materialism, the place where meaning and matter are completely entangled, where discourses and infrastructures conspire to shape the global society in which we live (Scott and others, 2014:287).

3.2.2. Very Few Social Products

- Excessive sale of personal products leads to social costs. For example, the increase in car ownership requires more parking, road, traffic control need (which are social goods), as well as traffic chaos, air pollution, deaths and injuries.
- It is necessary to establish a balance between personal and social products. The first option for this is to impose the social costs generated by the producers. For example, the government can take legal decisions to make car manufacturers produce safer, less polluting models. In this case, producers who can maintain this balance continue to exist.
- The second option should be the social costs of consumers. For example, in many parts of the world, motorway managers have developed tools for solving specific obstruction.
- More generally, if the costs of driving are not high enough, drivers will be able to get on the road during non-clogging times or find alternative means of transport.

People's needs within a situation are always changing, so designers must examine how relationships to products over time. Adaptation examines the product as an instigator for change — how it has an effect on people, place, and other products in use, effecting dynamic change on all of the factors in the Product Ecology. For example, a new technology product might replace or augment other products that functionally accomplish the same thing, encouraging certain activities and discouraging others. A product might force changes to a space, or evolve new features within a particular environment. For

example, people might modify their homes by opening up floor space to make more efficient use of a new appliance or assistive product (Forlizzi, 2008:11).

3.2.3. Cultural Pollution

- Our senses are constantly under siege by advertisements. This insidious practice affects our children badly every day.
- The advertisements interrupts the important programmes, advertisement pages cover the articles and distract the attention, billboards mess the views.
- These practices constantly pollute people's minds with messages of materialism, sexuality, power and status. (The arguments here are the secret law of advertising.)
- The fact that children are constantly exposed to advertisements has revealed the concept of “merchant children”. They specialize in bothering their parents and cause them to deposit a large amount of money into branded and fashionable products.

Television now reaps most of the advertising dollars, but newer technologies are providing new ways for marketers to reach children. Marketing practices such as repetition, branded environments, and free prizes are effective in attracting children's attention, making products stay in their memory (Calvert, 2008:224).

Marketers replies to these claims;

- Marketers hope that their advertisements primarily reach to the target audience. But because of the mass media, advertisements also reach people who are indifferent to marketed products and services.
- As for the impact of advertising on children, parents and friends are more influential on children than advertisements.
- Many toys reached to record breaking sales without any advertising spending.
- Children have the ability to interpret messages with a critical approach and make their own decisions (Freud's definition of “id” claims otherwise).
- Magazine readers are not influenced by advertisement pages and focus more on their posts. In addition, these advertising make magazines and newspapers cheaper. TV advertisements can also be zapped by viewers or advertisement free broadcast channels can be viewed.

3.2.4. Too Much Political Power

Critics say companies use too much political power. Petroleum, cigarettes, pharmaceuticals, financial services and alcohol companies are supporting public policy makers, as well as key politicians and public officials who take advantage of companies.

- Advertisers are accused of having too much power on the media.
- Today, many companies realized the importance of social responsibility and were domesticated as a result of public interest and pressure.
- For example, some laws in the west force automobile companies to make safer vehicles and cigarette companies to put warns about health issues on the cigarette packages.

Matten and Crane (2005) suggest that in the course of this development some business firms have even begun to assume a state-like role. They argue that many companies fulfil the functions of protecting, enabling, and implementing citizenship rights, which have originally been considered the sole responsibility of the state and its agencies (Marshall, 1965). Matten and Crane (2005) hold that these corporate activities often occur in cases where the state system fails, i.e. when the state withdraws or has to withdraw, when the state has not yet implemented basic citizenship rights, or when it is principally unable or unwilling to do so.

3.2.5. Deceptive Advertising And Promotion Campaigns

Public relations campaigns and programs with the company's products and image promotion activities for the company sometimes may be adorned with false promises and hints. These promises and

implications can ultimately transform the activities carried out into a collection of lies (Şentürk, 2008: 81-97). For example, Starbucks offers Ethos water brand and carries out a social responsibility campaign through this product. In the campaign, it is said that Starbucks will take the help to places where water shortages are taking place in the world and every bottle taken will make a difference. The design of the product is in line with the relevant social responsibility campaign and gives the impression that all of the \$ 1.8 is given to the campaign. However, the aid per item is \$ 0.05 which is 5 cents. How much difference for the water shortage in the world can be made with the 5 cents left for the sold 0.5 liters of water bottles should be questioned.

The survey conducted by the International Public Relations Association (IPRA) in 52 countries clearly prove the interests of the links between the media and the public relations industry. According to the results of the survey, paid news is so common in the world that almost all the news we read is a product of public relations. Companies achieve this goal in two ways. The first is to give editors money and gifts, and secondly by recruiting them.

Journalists in Turkey are also responsible for defending the interests of the companies that hire themselves in the media under the name of “consultant”. For example, a journalist’s working for a company or a public relations agency, as well as the journal, is considered extremely normal in Australia.

According to the results of Erdoğan's research (Erdoğan, 2005: 356), the proportion of those who devote their time to public relations from journalism is about 60% in Australia. As Turkey is included, the level of this is about 35% in Southern Europe. Those who do not mix journalism with public relations companies live mainly in North America. The proportion of journalists working for public relations companies in North America covers a total of 5% of the total.

The world of media and public relations has a relationship of interest between each other, which inevitably entails mutual solidarity and the creation and use of support mechanisms necessary for this solidarity. Thus, for example, the advertised newspaper will naturally refrain from a publication or news that would disrupt its relationship with the advertiser (Senturk, 2008: 81-97).

Advertising agencies follow similar methods in each country to create psychological pressure on newspapers. According to the IPRA report, the advertising agencies that want to create pressure on the editors send their press releases to the advertising services of the same newspaper. While Southern Europe (35%), Asia (42%) and Latin America (59%) use this method widely, advertising agencies in the country choose public relations as a second profession in Australia and news agents in this country do not send news bulletins to newspapers. However, in some countries, advertising reporting has become so evident that newspapers can demand the cost of color separation of the photographs of the companies that they report on the pages (Erdogan, 2005: 356). There are more striking results in the survey:

News is published on the basis of external influences (such as paid news, advertisement unit pressure): Eastern Europe 63%, Africa-Middle East 40%, Southern Europe 35%, Northwest Europe 21%, Australia 20%, Asia 16%, North America 13%.

Publications have a written policy of accepting gifts from third parties, including discounted products: Africa-Middle East 20%, Eastern Europe 22%, South and Central America 29%, Southern Europe 30%, Asia 31%, Australia 40%, Northwest Europe 56, North America 70%.

A newspaper or journalist agrees to receive money in order to withdraw from the publication of news: South and Central America 41%, Eastern Europe 28%, Asia 26%, Africa-Middle East 20%, Southern Europe 20%, Northwest Europe 5%, Australia 0%, North America 0%.

The statements that companies use in marketing their products as “healthy” and “environmentally sensitive” should also be questioned in terms of being misleading and deceptive. When introducing the product, it is necessary to have a functioning control mechanism in order to limit the use of these statements and to prove its accuracy.

To give an example, in 1950 within advertisement of the margarin that began to be produced in Turkey, the use of the expression of "for the sake of many more healthy generations", prove the deceptiveness of the previously broadcasted advertisements on the hydrogenated oils which have been proved to be harmful for the health scientifically (gidadedektifi, 2018). Therefore, the prevalence of advertisements that have a negative impact on human health without any evidence being presented on the basis of

scientific data and that are misleading in the minds of consumers is also within the scope of marketing ethics.

3.3. The Effect Of Marketing On Other Business

There are three different challenges on this issue: marketing of competitors, marketing practices that prevent market entry, and fraudulent marketing practices in terms of competition (Kotler et al., 2004).

3.3.1. Purchasing The Competitors

- The recent mergers and acquisitions of the industry have led to concerns that new and well-known firms will disappear and competition will decline.
- The number of companies in each major industry (motor vehicles, financial services, food, entertainment, telecommunications) is decreasing.
- The acquisition of competitors is a complex matter. This is sometimes good for society. Combined firms benefit from economies of scale, thus reducing costs and prices.
- A poorly managed company can be purchased by the well managed one.
- A non-competitive industry can become competitive after mergers.
- They can be followed by states and commercial organizations as they can lead to monopolization and trusts.

3.3.2. Prevention Of Market Access

- The use of patents and excessive promotions may bind suppliers and distributors to the company and remove them from their competitors.
- Those who are concerned about anti-trust regulation mention that the creation of some barriers to the market is a natural result of doing business in a wide range. The other obstacles can be tackled through existing or new laws. For example, in order to reduce the cost of sales, which is an important obstacle to entry into the market, an increased taxation on advertising could be considered.

3.3.3. Fraudulent Marketing Practices In Terms Of Competition

- Some companies perform fraudulent practices to destroy their competitors.
- They can lower product prices below costs, threaten suppliers to cut orders or run down the goods of a competitor's products.
- For example, using the Windows operating system forces us to use other Windows software. Even if the software of the competing companies is better than this operating system, they cannot be used. This breaks competition, decreases choice and slows down innovation.
- In some countries, Coca Cola offers its customers a cooler cupboard and filling machine in case they do not sell the other company's beverage; proposes special prices if they keep the entire product range in stock. It also offers discounts to its distributors for incentives to increase sales.

The lack of strategic concerns in the product market tends to encourage fraud. The use of relative performance evaluation tends to encourage fraud. The lack of information collection about individual firms tends to decrease the probability of fraud detection and through the deterrence of detection increase the probability of fraud commission. All of these aspects are more likely to be present in more competitive industries, implying that fraud propensity can be higher in those industries (Wang and others, 2012:29).

4. CONCLUSION

The concept of marketing ethics is a topic that has been widely discussed and has recently become increasingly important. Obtaining accurate information about the actions and transactions of the enterprises that claim to behave in accordance with ethical principles regarding marketing practices has a key importance in evaluating the actions and discourses of these enterprises. All actors (government, non-governmental organizations, corporations, media, individuals, etc.) have a duty to maintain and increase the consistency ratio in the relationship between discourse and action. Lack of value is

increasingly becoming an important problem. Ethical effectiveness is only possible with the joint efforts and contributions of social actors. It is critical for these actors to assume the responsibility to know the rights of consumers, to defend these rights when necessary and to apply to the competent authorities in case of dispute.

In the light of these criticisms which are brought to marketing by the enterprises which are economic units as well as social units, different structures can be used to create an effective ethical culture in the organization. Ethical code, ethics committee, ethical responsible, ethical training, ethics-oriented HRM practices, selection of managers who are consistent with ethical values, transparency and social responsibility are examples of these structures. All these processes need to be strengthened and expanded with the leadership of the board and department managers and the active participation of the employees. The actions of the senior management to encourage ethical behavior or to encourage unethical behaviors also affect the behavior of marketing managers (Akaah / Riordan, 1989: 119).

As a result, it should be seen as a part of the social responsibility to support the enterprises that operate by taking the ethical principles into consideration and reflect this to the internal decision making processes and encourage other enterprises to adopt ethical values. With this study, the practices of companies which are criticized for not being ethical about marketing are outlined and the arrangements that can be made in the relevant enterprises are discussed.

REFERENCES

- AKAAH, I. P., RIORDAN, E. A. (1989), Judgment of Marketing Professionals about Ethical Issues in Marketing Research: A Replication and Extension, *Journal of Marketing Research*, 26/1: 112-120.
- ALTUNIŞIK, R., ÖZDEMİR, Ş., TORLAK, Ö. (2002), *Modern pazarlama*, Sakarya: Değişim Yayınları.
- ARAS, G. (2004), *İş Etiği*, İfomag Dergisi.
- BAYRAM, S. (2005), Business Ethics And A Research Devoted To The Measurement Of The Workers' Perceptions Concerning The Companies' Present Ethical Applications, (Unpublished Postgraduate Thesis, Uludag University, Bursa).
- BELK, R. W., GER, G., & ASKEGAARD, S. (2003), The fire of desire: A multisited inquiry into consumer passion. *Journal of consumer research*, 30(3), 326-351.
- BELK, R. W., & POLLAY, R. W. (1985), Images of ourselves: The good life in twentieth century advertising. *Journal of Consumer Research*, 11(4), 887-897.
- BRENNAN, M. (1991), Is There More To Ethical Marketing Than Marketing Ethics?, *Marketing Bulletin*, Vol. 2, 8-17.
- CAMENISCH, P. F. (1991), Marketing ethics: some dimensions of the challenge. *Journal of Business Ethics*, 10(4), 245-248.
- CALVERT, S. L. (2008), Children as consumers: Advertising and marketing. The future of children, 205-234.
- CEVIK, E. M. (2011), Promotion Methods Used In Food Products And Effect Of Advertising (Master's thesis, Namık Kemal University).
- CHEAH, E.T., CHAN, W.L., CHIENG, C.LL. (2007), The Corporate Social Responsibility of Pharmaceutical Product Recalls: An Empirical Examination of U.S. and U.K. Markets. *Journal of Business Ethics*, 76 (4), 427-449.
- CHONKO, L. B. (1995), *Ethical decision making in marketing*. Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage.
- CRANE, A. (2001), Unpacking the Ethical Product, *Journal of Business Ethics*, Vol. 30, 361-373.
- DAWAR, N., & PILLUTLA, M. M. (2000), Impact of product-harm crises on brand equity: The moderating role of consumer expectations. *Journal of marketing research*, 37(2), 215-226.

- DE MATOS, C. A., & ROSSI, C. A. V. (2007), Consumer reaction to product recalls: factors influencing product judgement and behavioural intentions. *International Journal of Consumer Studies*, 31 (1), 109-116.
- DIBB, S. (2001), Marketing planning best practice. *The Marketing Review*, 2(4), 441-459.
- ERGENELI, A. (1996), Business Ethics: An Indispensable Course For Business Administration Curricula, *HU BF Journal*, 14, 99-107.
- ESKIN, G. J., & BARON, P. H. (1977), Effects of price and advertising in test-market experiments, *Journal of Marketing Research*, 499-508.
- FARRIS, P. W., & ALBION, M. S. (1980), The impact of advertising on the price of consumer products. *The Journal of Marketing*, 17-35.
- FORLIZZI, J. (2008), The product ecology: Understanding social product use and supporting design culture. *International Journal of design*, 2(1).
- FRITSCHKE, D.J., H. BECKER (1983), Ethical behaviors of marketing managers, *Journal of Business Ethics*, 2 (11), 291-299.
- GIDADEDEKTIFI. (2018), retrieved 13.10.2018, from https://www.instagram.com/p/BrPfTlyA3X1/?utm_source=ig_share_sheet&igshid=1t5wsdt2enihp
- GUILTINAN, J. (2009), Creative destruction and destructive creations: environmental ethics and planned obsolescence. *Journal of business ethics*, 89(1), 19-28.
- GULER, Y. B. (2014), Comparison Of Ethical Perspective Of Business And Customers In Retail Sector. *Selcuk University Social Sciences Institute Journal*, (31), 65-75.
- GUMMESON, E. (2000), *Qualitative methods in management research*. London: Sage.
- HORSKA, E., Ūrgeová, J., & Prokeínová, R. (2011), Consumers' food choice and quality perception: Comparative analysis of selected Central European countries. *Agricultural Economics*, 57(10), 493-499.
- HUNT, S.D., VASQUEZ-PARRAGA, A.Z. (1993), Organizational consequences, marketing ethics, and salesforce supervision, *Journal of Marketing Research*, Vol. 30, February, pp. 78-90.
- INDOUNAS, K. (2008), The relationship between pricing and ethics in two industrial service industries, *Journal of Business & Industrial Marketing*, 23(3), 161-169.
- JOLLY, D. W., & MOWEN, J. C. (1985), Product recall communications: The effects of source, media, and social responsibility information, *ACR North American Advances*.
- KESIM, A. K. (2004), Theoretical Framework of Marketing Ethics and an Assessment of Marketing Practices in Turkey from an Ethical Perspective, (Doctoral dissertation, Adnan Menderes University).
- KOTLER, P., R. TURNER (1981), *Marketing Management*, Prentice.Hall, Englewood, Cliffs.
- KOTLER P. (1994), *Marketing Management*, New Jersey: Pearson Education.
- KOTLER, P., & ARMSTRONG, G. (2004), *Marketing*, Praha.
- KURTULDU, H. (2009), Marketing Ethics In Banking And It's Impacts On The Formation Of Positive Attitude, *International Journal of Economic and Administrative Studies*, vol: 1, no: 2, 83-96.
- MAGNO, F. (2012), Managing product recalls: The effects of time, responsible vs. opportunistic recall management and blame on consumers' attitudes. *Procedia-Social and Behavioral Sciences*, 58, 1309-1315.
- MARSHALL, T. H.(1965), *Class, Citizenship and Social Development*. New York:Anchor Books.
- MATTEN, D., & CRANE, A. (2005), What is stakeholder democracy? Perspectives and issues. *Business Ethics: A European Review*, 14(1), 6-13.

- MUCUK, İ. (2007), *Reklam ve Halkla İlişkiler. Pazarlama İlkeleri*, Türkmen Kitabevi, 16.Baskı, İstanbul, 211-233.
- POJMAN, L. P. (2001), *Ethics: Discovering Right and Wrong*, (4th edn., Belmont: Wadsworth/Thomson Learning).
- PUJARI, D. (2006), Eco-innovation and new product development: understanding the influences on market performance, *Technovation*, 26(1), 76-85.
- PRUITT, S. W., & PETERSON, D. R. (1986), Security price reactions around product recall announcements, *Journal of Financial Research*, 9(2), 113-122.
- RAO, V. R. (1984), Pricing research in marketing: The state of the art, *Journal of Business*, S39-S60.
- RAPHAEL, D. D. (1994), *Moral Philosophy*, 2nd enlarged edn., Oxford: Oxford University Press.
- SCOTT, K., MARTIN, D. M., & SCHOUTEN J. W. (2014), Marketing and the new materialism. *Journal of Macromarketing*, 34(3), 282-290.
- SCHLEGELMILCH, B. B. (1998), *Marketing ethics: An international perspective*, Cengage Learning EMEA.
- SENTURK, T.(2007), A study on the conflict between Dogan and Uzan media groups in terms of public relations ethics, *Journal of Communication, Theory and Research*, Vol. 24, No.1:63.
- SENTURK T., AY, C. (2008), The Ethical Boundaries of Public Relations, *Celal Bayar University Institute of Social Sciences*, Vol.6, No.1:81-97.
- SENTURK, T. (2010), *Pazarlama Yönlü Halkla ilişkiler ve Etik*, Canan Ay, Burak Kartal, Sinan Nardalı (Ed.), *Pazarlamada Etik Yaklaşımlar içinde*, (s. 165-194), Detay Yayıncılık, Ankara.
- SEKER, A. (2013), *İş Etiği*, Açıköğretim Fakültesi Yayınları, Eskişehir.
- SINGER, P. (1993), *Practical Ethics*, 2nd edn, Cambridge Universty Press, Cambridge.
- SMITH, N. C., QUELCH, J. A. (1996), *Ethics in marketing*, McGraw-Hill/Irwin.
- SOUIDEN, N., & PONS, F. (2009), Product recall crisis management: The impact on manufacturer's image, consumer loyalty and purchase intention. *Journal of Product and Brand Management*, 18, 106-114.
- STANTON, W. J., Etzel, M. J., & Walker, B. J. (1991), *Fundamentals of Marketing*, MacGraw Hill. *International Edition*.
- SOZCU. (2018), retrieved 12. 10. 2018, from <https://www.sozcu.com.tr/2018/ekonomi/yaniltici-indirim-tuketici-hakem-heyetine-takildi-2777685/>
- TEK, Ö., B. ve ENGİN Ö. (2007), *Modern Pazarlama İlkeleri Uygulamalı Yönetimsel Yaklaşım*, İzmir: Birleşik Matbaacılık.
- TORLAK, Ö. (2001), *Pazarlama Ahlakı*, İstanbul: Beta Yayınları.
- TREVINO, L. K., & NELSON, K. A. (1995). *Managing Business Ethics*.
- TUSIAD Business Ethics and Ethical Management in the World and in Turkey Report . (2009) retrieved 10 10. 2018, from <https://tusiad.org/tr/yayinlar/raporlar/item/3675-dunyada-ve-turkiyede-is-etigi-ve-etik-yonetimi>
- WANG, T., WINTON, A. (2012), Competition and corporate fraud waves.
- WHYSALL, P. (2000), Addressing ethical issues in retailing: a stakeholder perspective. *The International Review of Retail, Distribution and Consumer Research*, 10(3), 305-318.
- WITTINK, D. R. (1977), Exploring territorial differences in the relationship between marketing variables. *Journal of Marketing Research*, 145-155.